



Advocacy - Governance - Renewal

## **NAGAR Comprehensive Report (2000 – 2019)**

NAGAR is a not for profit organization established in 2000, born out of the passion of several ordinary citizens with a goal to improve life in the city of Mumbai. It works in the areas of **preservation of public open spaces, solid waste management, improvement in ambient air quality, preservation of water bodies, beaches, mangroves and built & natural heritage features, efficient road space management, water conservation and better policing.** Its creed has been strong and consistent advocacy with Government and its agencies for better implementation of existing laws, suggesting changes in policies for better governance in civic related issues and working towards urban renewal. It has a vast citizen base spread over the city and networks with other civic NGOs on specific issues.

***Erstwhile constituents of NAGAR now amalgamated: Clean Air (CA); CitiSpace (CS); Clean Sweep Forum (CSF)***

### **Governance issues:**

- In the absence of any NGO to do background work in 'A' Ward, in the run up to the **BMC elections of 2002**, NAGAR stepped into the breach and **organised 'A' Ward Election watch (A.W.E.)**. Awareness as to the importance of civic elections, dissemination of information via a barrage of fliers, organising core group activity, meetings - of residents, candidates etc., drafting Local Citizens' Manifestos and a "Vote for Mumbai" Rally on Independence Day, NAGAR was in the forefront of organising all these in the four municipal constituencies of 'A' Ward. It **succeeded in registering a 7.33% increase in voter turnout in one of these constituencies and set up 'Constituency Citizens' Councils (CCC) in three of four municipal constituencies of the Ward.**
- Loksatta's Mumbai branch begun an initiative on persuading the State Government and the Municipal Corporation **toward implementing the 74<sup>th</sup> Amendment of the Constitution by forming Ward Committees with citizen participation.** NAGAR

was actively interacting with them on this subject. It participated in their “**Vote Mumbai Campaign**”.

### **Draft Development Plan:**

- The Draft Development Plan (i.e. DDP) (2014 – 2034) was proposed by MCGM. To which NAGAR responded with suggestions and objections. NAGAR took a **strong stand that heritage structures must be inducted in the new Development Plan (DP)** being drafted. NAGAR has **extensively participated in the public consultation and debate process of the Development Plan of Greater Mumbai**. NAGAR has regularly written suggestions & objections to the MCGM & the Urban Development Department, Government of Maharashtra.
- As a public awareness campaign, NAGAR **launched a micro-website on DP** that kept the citizens well-informed & updated. **Using the tools of Digital Marketing, it disseminated and promoted its viewpoint** regarding several issues enumerated in the MCGM's DDP (2014 – 2034), drawing on the experience and learnings of its programs over the years. **To make its impact felt it used various social media channels, namely Facebook, Twitter, YouTube and so on. Mr. Cyrus Broacha and Mr. Vishal Dadlani acted as the cause ambassadors** who helped promote NAGAR's role on the issues related to DP. **YouTube movies and podcast** were used as mediums to put forth its stand.
- The **Trustees of NAGAR were signatories to an open letter, written to the Chief Minister of Maharashtra, Mr. Devendra Fadnavis** and signed by distinguished citizens, **urging right action for the city's future development**. It was **published in the Hindustan Times** on April 21, 2015.
- The **DDP was scrapped by the Chief Minister** of Maharashtra, Mr. Devendra Fadnavis and a **Revised Draft Development Plan** (i.e. RDDP) (2014 – 2034) was prepared. **NAGAR** had actively responded to the DDP and then to the RDDP by **submitting its suggestions and objections** from time-to-time. Also, a **special social media link was created** and added to the NAGAR website for this purpose. NAGAR wrote letters to Mr. R. Balchandran, the Chief Engineer (DP) and Mr. Ramanath Jha, Officer on Special Duty (OSD, DP) highlighting the flaws that still

existed in the RDDP 2034 and certain new additions that were completely unacceptable to the citizens.

- On December 27, 2018, the **Mumbai Port Trust (MbPT) notified the Draft Proposals for development along the Eastern Waterfront (EWF)** of Greater Mumbai, for which it is a Special Planning Authority (SPA), and invited suggestions and objections from the public for the same. **NAGAR submitted its suggestions & objections** which addressed some of the salient features of the proposal, including a **proposal for a park through reclamation of 90 Ha and the reservation surrounding Sewri fort, and the regulations which govern the protection of Natural Areas.**

### **Eastern Waterfront:**

- NAGAR was invited for a hearing regarding the Notified Development Plan (DP) for the Eastern Waterfront, by the MbPT, Special Planning Authority (SPA). NAGAR reiterated the views expressed in its letter of suggestions and objections.
- NAGAR had **stressed upon** the importance of ensuring that the land made available to the city must be used for **public amenities**, and especially **public open spaces**, as a **severe lack of these is felt across the city**. We **objected to the proposal to reclaim 90 Ha of the sea for a park**, due to the fact that **reclamation could lead to ecological imbalance**, and that public open spaces must be distributed across a layout and not be restricted to a corner. We also addressed the depiction of Sewri Fort in the Proposed Land Use sheet, as the area immediately surrounding it has been reserved as 'Residential'.

### **Public Open Spaces:**

- The matter relating to the **adoption of Recreational Grounds (RGs) and Playgrounds (PGs), Parks & Gardens** was sent to the Government of Maharashtra (GoM) for approval **by the MCGM**. The **GoM approved the introduction of Caretaker Policy** on open spaces and asked the MCGM to draft a policy. **CitiSpace objected to the policy and brought the controversial policy to the public domain by public hearings, press conferences, public debates and lobbying with the Politicians all through 2007.**

- **An open letter was written to the then Chief Minister to stop the Caretaker Policy on Public Open Spaces.** It was drafted by CitiSpace and CLEAN-Air and signed by prominent citizens, namely, Justice B. N. Srikrishna (Retd.), Justice S. Variava (Retd.), Mr. Sharad Kale, Mr. D. M. Sukthankar, Mr. Satish Sahney, Mr. Julio Rebeiro, Mr. Cyrus Guzder, Mr. Nasser Munjee, Mr. Gerson Da Cunha, Mrs. Sheilu Srinivasan, Mr. Debi Goenka, Ms. Shirin Bharucha, Mr. Shailesh Gandhi, Mrs. Nayana Kathpalia, Mrs. Neera Punj and Mrs. Meher Razaat. Post the publication of this letter **the then CM stayed the Caretaker Policy.** The **said Policy allowed building clubs and gymkhanas on public open spaces which meant private encroachment on public land.** [The letter was published in the Hindustan Times dtd. 26.11.2007.]
- **‘The CitiSpace Reporter’**, a 16 page illustrated newsletter was put together to disseminate and convey the triumphs and trials of CitiSpace’s endeavors to its members as well as inform citizens at large on issues relating to governance and administration of Public Spaces. The Reporter was distributed at all public meetings and forums where CitiSpace put forth its point of view.
- **Assistant Municipal Commissioners (AMCs) of several wards were met by CitiSpace office bearers, Coordinator and local members to ensure that the Rs.5 crores allocated to each ward for maintenance and greening of the ward’s open spaces were being judiciously used.** Local individuals and organizations were assisted by CitiSpace in drafting RTI applications, using the information gathered and dealing with local authorities to ensure that reserved open spaces in the neighbourhood are secure and well-maintained. An **exemplary instance** of these efforts is the **re-claiming of an RG in A ward by getting the MCGM to demolish an existing kitchen on the site and greening the plot** for the purpose for which it is reserved.
- **CitiSpace released the book “Breathing Space: A Fact File of 600 Reserved Open Spaces in Greater Mumbai” on 26<sup>th</sup> June 2010.** This publication contains 600 proformas, several maps, plans, sketched layouts and photographic evidence, etc. with ascertained ownership of the plot, details of the site from the DP, a satellite image all reflecting in the best manner the **Survey of Reserved Open Spaces of Greater Mumbai conducted by CitiSpace.** This survey was

done **under CitiSpace Coordinator Ar. Parul Kumtha's guidance**, with the **assistance of two junior architects and 10 teams comprising 44 student architects** who worked on different wards in Greater Mumbai. The teams visited each and every designated site, i.e. **a total of 1429 public open spaces**.

- Local Individuals and organizations were assisted by CitiSpace in their struggles to protect their neighbourhood open spaces. Besides regular help in the form of helping with RTI applications, meeting local and central authorities as the need may be and **guiding them with rules and regulations, etc. to ensure that Reserved Open Space are well maintained, CitiSpace held 2 workshops with its members**. At these a handout explaining the various issues related to protecting the city's Open Spaces was distributed and several hours of interactive discussions with local members, answering their queries and strategizing on a way forward. **The first such workshop was at Five Gardens, Parsi Colony, Dadar on 17 Sep 2011 and a second member workshop at St. Paul's Church Hall at Parel, F/south on 5 Nov 2011.**
- In 2010, the MCGM proposed a policy for 'Development of Plots reserved for Public Purposes such as Gymnasiums/Gymkhanas, Clubs, Stadiums, Swimming-pools, Recreation Grounds, Playgrounds, Gardens and Parks' that was primarily aimed at creating private and commercial interests on Reserved Public Open Spaces.

CitiSpace rejected the proposed policy completely and asked the State Government & MCGM to work-out a well thought out Policy in which the MCGM itself looked after its own lands. It also insisted that it must be prepared in time to be added to the new DCRs & DP coming up in 2014. There was absolutely no reason to push such a detrimental and citizen-unfriendly Policy at such a time – just 3 years short of the new DCRs & DP, then. CitiSpace **followed up** the response to this detrimental Proposed Policy for Open Spaces by the MCGM **by writing to the then Chief Minister of Maharashtra, the Secretary (Environment), Govt. of Maharashtra and the elected representatives (MPs and MLAs)**. While Shri Prithviraj Chavan, the then CM and Ms. Valsa Nair, the then Secretary (Environment) supported CitiSpace's vision for

Public Open Spaces in Greater Mumbai, several MPs and MLAs, too, were positively committed to protect them.

- CitiSpace participated in the **Young Expressions Programme – “My City My Park”** by sending in a power point presentation outlining the issues of green spaces in the city.
- Students of Tata Institute Social Sciences course on Habitat Studies met with the CitiSpace Coordinator to learn about the various policies and authorities governing Reserved Open Spaces in Greater Mumbai.
- CitiSpace appointed as an **Expert on the Committee constituted by a Government Resolution under the Chairmanship of the Municipal Commissioner to formulate a “Uniform Policy for Comprehensive planning and development of open spaces within the limits of Mumbai Municipal Corporation”**. CitiSpace has draft recommendations for changes required in the Development Control Rules (DCRs) of Greater Mumbai to protect misuse of Reserved Public Open Spaces.
- **Maharashtra Nature Park (MNP) was proposed to be included in the Sector-5 of Dharavi Redevelopment Proposal**. The proposed inclusion would have allowed incorporation of a public open space admeasuring 41 acres within the proposed layout of Dharavi Redevelopment Project (DRP). However, its location being at one side of the layout raised concerns about an eventual compromise of public open spaces throughout the layout. **NAGAR strongly objected to it and put on record that MNP must be de-linked from all potential development ventures and remain as a stand-alone entity unconditionally**. Following the publication of the notification, the **Chief Minister** of Maharashtra, Mr. Devendra Fadnavis, as per article published in the Indian Express, dtd 23.03.2018, **assured** the citizens of Mumbai that **Mahim Nature Park will be retained as a natural area, and no construction will be permitted on it**.

**NAGAR organized a meeting with activists and organisations** (BEAG, AGNI, APLI Mumbai, UDRI and Zoru Bhatena) to discuss further action for protection of MNP.

NAGAR also **filed RTI applications at various concerned authorities** (Dharavi Redevelopment Project Office, MHADA, SRA, MCGM, MMRDA, UDD and Forest

and Revenue Department) **to seek all relevant information** about MNP – Ownership, Status, Proposals, etc.). **The information acquired and the citizens' collective efforts resulted in excluding the MNP from the DRP.** It was a well-informed and coordinated effort by the citizens to save this green lung of the city which was being viewed as a real estate opportunity.

- **NAGAR raised concerns about the existing policy on public open spaces on following issues: Mumbai Port Trust Land; Mahalaxmi Racecourse land and the Caretaker and Adoption Policy**

NAGAR organised a public meeting, along with WECOM Trust and AGNI, to protest against the Maharashtra Government's cabinet decision to extend the use of playgrounds for non-sport activities, especially political meetings from 30 days to 45 days in a year. This decision will make playgrounds unusable for 5.5 months in a year! A resolution was passed at the public meeting reflecting the objection which was sent to the Chief Minister. **It raised concerns about the new draft policy concerning public open spaces, which has incorporated terms of the erstwhile Caretaker policy in some of its clauses.** NAGAR has brought this to the notice of the Chief Minister of Maharashtra, resulting in the policy being reconsidered.

- **NAGAR strongly objected to the MCGM's Interim Public Open Space Policy as the draft policy was still pending with the State Government.** The interim policy facilitated an unacceptable option to private organisations, NGOs and citizen groups to enable them to retain their hold over the 216 public open spaces that were to be taken back from them under the orders of the Chief Minister, Mr. Fadnavis. NAGAR is of the view that there has to be a final public open space policy and no interim or piece-meal policies.
- In an another letter, **NAGAR wrote to the Chief Minister, Mr. Fadnavis objecting to the construction of 'Theme Park' on the Mahalaxmi Racecourse Land. NAGAR stated that the racecourse land is one of the few large open spaces which serve as a green lung as well as a natural sponge during the monsoons for the Island city. Also, it is Grade II-B heritage structure as per the heritage list appended to the Heritage Regulations for Greater Bombay, 1995.**

- **NAGAR has proposed rejuvenation of vulnerable open spaces – gardens, parks, playgrounds and recreational grounds. To start with, NAGAR identified a plot near Mahim, designated as a playground, which was given under caretaker but was used for illegal parking.** NAGAR visited the G-North ward office to bring to the notice of Mr. Biradar, the Assistant Municipal Commissioner that the said plot, i.e. the W.I.T. playground needs immediate attention and proper maintenance. NAGAR continued to urge the MCGM to follow Best Practices for maintaining all Public Open Spaces owned by them. **NAGAR has prepared the design to restore the character of the said playground and showcase an ideal plan to rejuvenate this plot** with the help of conservation architects at Nature-Nurture Architects & Planners.
- **NAGAR wrote a letter to the Chief Minister, Mr. Devendra Fadnavis on February 27, 2018 urging him to direct the MCGM to take back all the public open spaces, without making an exception and formulate the open space policy.** NAGAR stated that the CM must revive & re-examine the Draft Report submitted by the Expert Committee constituted by a G.R. dated November 03, 2012, under the Chairmanship of the Municipal Commissioner to formulate a 'Uniform Policy for Comprehensive Planning & Development of Open Spaces within the limits of MCGM' & direct the MCGM to use it as a basis to formulate an open space policy for the betterment of the city & its people. **NAGAR was quoted in news reports on this issue.**
- **NAGAR wrote to the Municipal Commissioner objecting to MCGM's proposed facility of an underground pay & park on a public open space at Byculla.** This would amount to change of land use, depriving citizens of this space and loss of permeability of the public open space due to concretization of the ground for parking. **NAGAR was quoted in news reports on this issue.**
- **NAGAR wrote to Mr. Praveen Pardeshi, the Municipal Commissioner, MCGM on May 23, 2019 regarding the formulation of public open spaces policy.** NAGAR reiterated that the public open spaces need urgent attention and must be protected, conserved and maintained for the period of 20 years of the Development Plan, i.e. from the year 2014 to 2034, in retrospective effective from the date of sanction. This would need a water-tight open spaces policy in place. It was



proposed that a Municipal Ward level Committee should be constituted having members from the authorities as well civil society in the form of local stakeholders. Such a Committee should consist of the Assistant Municipal Commissioner (Ward Officer), one ward official of the garden department, the Deputy Municipal Commissioner (concerned Zone), the local Corporator in who's jurisdiction the public open space falls and a maximum of 3 representatives of local resident associations / Advanced Locality Management group (ALMs) and non-government organisations (NGOs).

**A meeting was convened at the Municipal Commissioner's office to discuss on various issues** like public parking lots, public open spaces, urban forestry, solid waste management, rainwater harvesting, waste-water treatment and so on. **NAGAR was invited to give inputs on public open spaces policy.** The **Municipal Commissioner affirmatively spoke on adoption of public open spaces** by NGOs, Trusts and civil societies for a period of 11 years and ordered the Superintendent of Gardens to get the paved walkways in all the gardens removed with immediate effect. **As an outcome of this meeting, a Garden Experts Group was formed** on WhatsApp (a mobile application) for faster communication and swift action among the members of the group. **This group includes the Superintendent of Gardens, Deputy Superintendent of Gardens, other government officials, ward level officials, environmentalists, experts in urban forestry, NAGAR representatives.** The purpose of this group is to provide inputs on replicable models to restore public open spaces, draft water-tight policy for public open spaces, prepare an action plan, set achievable targets and keep the members updated on implementation.

**NAGAR will be submitting its case study on how a public open space be adopted and maintained efficiently.** Also, it has drafted **recommendations for public open spaces policy, being an expert** on the Committee for "Uniform Policy for Comprehensive planning and development of open spaces within the limits of Mumbai Municipal Corporation"

#### **4G antennae on Reserved Public Open Spaces:**

NAGAR has opposed the decision of the Government of Maharashtra and the MCGM to give permission to install 4G antennae towers (TCS/BS) on Reserved Public Open

Spaces. NAGAR filed a Public Interest Litigation (PIL) on 4G antennae tower (TBS) on Reserved Public Open Spaces with other co-petitioners being OVAL Trust and AGNI. NAGAR began an online petition on [www.change.org](http://www.change.org) asserting its objection on the issue. **The first hearing was held on July 20, 2015 and NAGAR obtained a stay on any further permission being given to such installations till the matter is heard.**

### **Street Vending issue:**

- NAGAR has always been in the forefront of the Street Vendor issue since 1998. As CitiSpace, it filed a **PIL in the Bombay High Court in 1998 (1722 of 1998)** with a prayer that the Court direct the MCGM to implement the 1985 Supreme Court Order which had laid down guidelines to allocate vending and non-vending zones in Greater Mumbai. We continued to be in the Courts (both Bombay High Court and the Supreme Court) till 2013 when the Supreme Court gave the final order in this matter. [All crucial orders can be referred to on NAGAR's website.]
- Throughout the legal process, NAGAR has always been in constant communication with its associates, citizens at large and the hawkers through meetings, correspondence and as CitiSpace, it **published a booklet in January 2004 titled "Hawking & Non-hawking zones in Greater Mumbai – Everything you want to Know" in English, Hindi and Marathi.** This was to disseminate the Supreme Court Order and other related matters.
- The idea of a **workshop on implementation of the Hawkers Scheme** was initiated by CitiSpace which was taken up enthusiastically by the then Deputy Municipal Commissioner (DMC) in-charge Dr. Kudalkar. It was held in F/North Ward Office on 14<sup>th</sup> March, 2008 and **was a great success with as many as 55 Ward officials participating.** Many issues regarding the Supreme Court Orders and the problems facing the MCGM officials were discussed.
- **CitiSpace wrote to Shri. Dilip Shrirao, the then Joint Commissioner (Vigilance) Food and Drug Administration (FDA) on 8<sup>th</sup> Sep, 2011, regarding their plans to tighten the FDA norms to ensure the availability of hygienic food in Greater Mumbai.** We informed the FDA about the **2003 Supreme Court Order in the Hawker Matter which banned cooking on the streets of Greater Mumbai.**

- On the same matter **CitiSpace** wrote to **Mr. S. G. Kunte**, the then **Municipal Commissioner** on 12.11.2012 following news items regarding plans to **train street food vendors in and around 55 *khau gallis* in Greater Mumbai on maintaining hygiene and safety standards** in the food they serve. Plans put together by the MCGM and the FDA, in consultation with Mr. J.K. Banthia, the then Chief Secretary, Maharashtra.
- **The final order on the Hawker Matter was delivered by the Supreme Court on 19-9-2013. In future any dispute arising on this subject will be heard only by the Bombay High Court.**
- **The Parliament passed the Street Vendors (Protection of Livelihood and Regulation of Street Vending) Act 2014** in the winter session of Parliament. Subsequently as per the SC order and the Act a **Town Vending Committee (TVC) was formed in Mumbai under the Chairmanship of the Municipal Commissioner** to formulate and implement Hawking & Non-Hawking Zones in Greater Mumbai. A **NAGAR Trustee was co-opted on it as an expert in the NGO category.**

**NAGAR addressed a letter to the Prime Minister for “Non- implementation of the Hawking Scheme leading to overcrowding, dirt & chaos on streets thus defeating the goal of *Swachhta* in India’s financial capital”**

- After the Central Street Vendors (Protection of Livelihood and Regulation of Vending) Act was enacted in 2014, **the Government of Maharashtra formulated the Street Vending Rules in 2016 and Scheme in 2017.**

**NAGAR had attended all meetings held by the MCGM & the Urban Development Department, Government of Maharashtra to discuss the Draft Rules proposed for the Street Vendors’ Act and submitted its suggestions and objections to the same. It was mandated that Town Vending Committees be formed by all local authorities.** Hence the MCGM formed one Central TVC (CTVC) and **7 Zonal TVCs (ZTVC)** for the 7 Municipal Zones in Mumbai. The first meeting of the CTVC was held on May 19, 2018. **As of now, 3 meetings of the Central TVC have been conducted and several meetings of the Zonal TVCs have been held. Vending and Non-Vending Zones have been approved,**

licensed vendors have been approved and a bye-law has been drafted by the MCGM which is being processed by the Improvements Committee.

- **NAGAR was officially nominated as an NGO member of the TVC (Zone-I) which comprises A, B, C, D and E wards.** NAGAR Trustee, Ms. Nayana Kathpalia represents NAGAR at the meetings. Till date, NAGAR has actively participated in all the TVC (Zone-I) meetings and contributed constructively in the process for demarcating street vending zones as per the guidelines laid down by the MCGM. **As of now, 4 meetings of the TVC (Zone-I) have been held. Vending & Non-Vending Zones and licensed vendors have been approved.**
- NAGAR conducts meetings with citizens' groups. Members from all the 7 Zonal TVCs and the 2 Central TVC members meet to discuss the issues faced by them while functioning as Zonal TVC members. NAGAR has been the **nodal point of coordination for the citizens to decide on a strategy and unite in action** to respond on the matters concerning Town Vending Committee and its agenda from time to time. This has **resulted in unified efforts to submit resolute suggestions & objections** and **solidarity among citizen groups to regulate hawking**, thereby making citizens' participation effective at the TVC meetings.

### **Solid Waste Management:**

- CLEAN-Sweep was transformed formally into the CLEAN-Sweep Forum (CSF) on 18<sup>th</sup> July 2003. In August 2003, at Churchgate station, **CLEAN-Sweep Forum (CSF) conducted an event for MCGM's Swachha Mumbai Abhiyan** with G.D.Somani school children where it **disseminated information on segregation of waste, vermin-composting, protection of footpaths and correct usage of road space.**
- One of the first major tasks CSF set itself was a **complete revamp of the Advanced Locality Management (ALM) scheme of the MCGM** as it exists today. CSF **advocated for conversion of ALMs into a legal entity**, an Independent Monitoring Body to ensure MCGM's efficient functioning. In this CSF received tremendous support from many ALMs, the All India Institute of Local Self-Government (AIIILSG), and past Assistant Municipal Commissioners (AMCs) of MCGM. CSF **partnered with AIIILSG conducted a study for MCGM which**

evaluated ALMs on the aspect of waste management techniques resulting in immediate cost savings to MCGM. It submitted the Project Report to the MCGM end September 2005. It was received well by Mr. Ratho, the then AMC in charge of SWM, and the meeting itself was so conducive that the parameters of payback to the ALMs were discussed then itself with MCGM pledging a generous amount to waste-managing ALMs. In February 2006, CSF and AILSG held two workshops at the AILSG placing the Report and its recommendations before the larger audience of NGOs and ALMs. A large number of people attended and pledged support to the cause of ALMs as recommended by the Report.

- The **Cuffe Parade Recycling Centre Project**: CSF successfully conducted a hands-on pilot project in Cuffe Parade in collaboration with the BMC and the Indian Centre for Plastics in the Environment (ICPE). Its goal was to create a replicable model for the collection, storage and recycling of 'dry' waste in the city keeping within the chain the ubiquitous rag-picker, traditionally so useful in reducing the solid waste burden on our landfills. Viewed as a partnership between the BMC, NGOs, Residential Associations and the citizens, the roles of each were clearly defined. It was a holistic attempt to avoid the litter and fire hazards of the traditional recycling chain and to take the waste directly from 'user' to 'destination'.
- CSF supported "**Mumbai Chaka-chak**", initiated in May by the Government of Maharashtra (GoM) in association with MCGM and Traffic Police. It addressed cleanliness and traffic issues in three wards of the city – 'A', H (W), and M (W). CSF helped with suggestions and action points at the conception stage and pledged to provide volunteer help when necessary. CSF pledged to support Mahindra and Mahindra's film called '**Mumbai Chaka-chak**' which aimed at giving the much needed impetus to the 'Clean-up Mumbai' campaign of MCGM. It met with the 'Mumbai Mantra' persons (who were doing the film for M & M) to give their inputs on solid waste management (SWM), researched painstakingly over the past few years.
- On June 5 2008, the eve of the World Environment Day, **Mumbai's first program on 'E-waste Awareness'** was organized by CSF at the Bombay Natural History Society. This was supported by '**Ecoreco**', a concern which is currently

the **only recycler of e - waste in the formal sector in Mumbai**. The event was chaired by the Hon. Sheriff of Mumbai and attended by the Secretary, Ministry of Environment, Mumbai's Municipal Commissioner, Member Secretary, MPCB, and the Consular Generals of Switzerland, Germany and France, all of whom addressed the gathering.

- A second programme on 'E-waste Awareness' was held at the Indian Merchants Chamber (IMC) on Sept.15 2008. This was also well attended and considerable interest was evinced by the participants. In 2009, **awareness programmes on e-Waste were conducted in a number of colleges across the city**, and they were a resounding success. **As part of the programme e-waste bins were donated to the colleges meant for the collection of discarded items of e-waste like floppies, CDs, print cartridges, cell phones.** These bins carry small panels explaining the hazards of e-waste and also who to contact for e-waste collection.
- A **Panel discussion** was organized at IMC, on Jan. 31 2009. The invitees included Director (Industries), GoM, Member Secretary of the Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Director of the AILSG, prominent citizens of the city, recyclers and NGOs. After prolonged discussions, it was **unanimously agreed that an Association be formed for evolving a workable and sustainable system of e-waste management in Mumbai**. Mr. Vijay Mukhi, Chairman of the I. T. Committee of IMC, offered to support the proposal and it was agreed that a core committee be formed. On Feb.12 2009, the **core committee met and formed the 'Maharashtra E - Waste Association' (MEWA) and a number of Industry Associations, Companies, and NGOs agreed to join as members**. These include IMC, Manufacturers Association of Information Technology (MAIT), Zenith Computers, ONIDA, three Companies of Recyclers, Toxics Link, YUVA Pratisthan, and CSF.
- **NAGAR received its commissioned research on "Solid Waste Management in Mumbai: Need for an Alternative Paradigm" from IIT – Mumbai in the month of March 2013.**
- **NAGAR prepared a People-Public-Private Partnership Model**. It was uploaded by NAGAR on the Prime Minister's web portal [www.mygov.in](http://www.mygov.in) under the program "Swachh Bharat Abhiyan" i.e. Clean India Mission. As an offshoot of this Model, NAGAR conducted a ward-wise survey analyzing the

functioning of the Solid Waste Management Department of MCGM. NAGAR published its work on its website titled as “Solid Waste Management and Handling at the Ward Level in Greater Mumbai – A NAGAR Report (December 10, 2014)

- **NAGAR drafted an Integrated Solid Waste Management Policy for Greater Mumbai 2016 – 2021 and presented the same to Mr. Ajoy Mehta, the then Municipal Commissioner, MCGM.** This policy was drafted by NAGAR to **constructively resolve the complex issue of managing solid waste** for a burgeoning metropolis like Greater Mumbai. The policy was based on observations and analysis of various reports. At times, the dumping grounds catch fire leading to an outbreak of respiratory diseases. Considering this urgent need, NAGAR drafted this policy to enable a partnership between the people and the MCGM to treat waste in an efficient and scientific manner.
- **NAGAR visited the MCGM’s Vermi-composting project at Cooper hospital** run by “Aastha” women’s Self-Help Group (SHG). It is an initiative of the K-West ward under Swachh Bharat Mission. This was **to understand the decentralized segregation and composting process carried out by bulk waste generators.**

## **Historic Natural & Built Heritage:**

### **Colaba Tourist Destination Association (CTDA):**

- NAGAR helped the CTDA to **facilitate the adoption of the Gateway promenade by the Taj Mahal Intercontinental Hotel and coordinate the street furniture to be used there.**
- NAGAR was **largely instrumental** [as an area stakeholder and because of its relationship with Mahindra and Mahindra (M&M)] **in getting M&M to agree, in principle, to fund the up-gradation of Steven Street, as also the Wellington Fountain** (a heritage grade I street artefact), **and to participate in the adoption of Mahakavi Bhushan Marg along with other stakeholders of the road.**
- CTDA put together a **monsoon festival “Chalo Colaba” to create an awareness among the area stakeholders and the citizens at large.** A brochure of the Colaba Tourist District Management Plan was released during the festival. It was published by the Urban Design Research Institute (UDRI) and sponsored by an

Page 15 of 25

area stakeholder the Taj Mahal Hotel. A Trustee of NAGAR was a co-editor of this publication as also involved in the festival.

### **Forts of Mumbai:**

- **NAGAR initiated the issue of rejuvenation of Forts of Mumbai**; a survey was conducted by students of architecture under the supervision of Architect Parul Kumtha. NAGAR networked with various government authorities like Mrs. Valsa Nair-Singh, the then Principal Secretary, Tourism & Culture, GoM; Mr. S. K. Patil, the then Director and Dr. Maya Patil, the then Deputy Director of the Directorate of Archaeology and Museums. **The survey culminated in publication of a book on 8 Forts of Mumbai titled “Forts of Mumbai – Abandoned Treasures”**. The book was released by Ms. Valsa Nair-Singh, the then Principal Secretary, Tourism & Culture, GoM at the Chhatrapati Shivaji Vastu Sangrahalaya.
- As a step further to the publication of NAGAR’s book, a project for rejuvenation of these Forts by working, in detail, was taken up. For the same, NAGAR began working closely with the relevant government authorities like Dr. Tejas Garge, the Director, Directorate of Archaeology & Museums, GoM and Mr. Bipin Chandra Negi, Superintending Archaeologist, Mumbai Circle, Archaeological Survey of India (Sion), Government of India.

A project report was prepared titled **“Rejuvenation of the Forts of Mumbai: A Tribute to Our Rich and Varied Heritage”**. The **objective** of the report is to advocate the **need for conservation of these protected monuments and rejuvenation of their sites as tourist areas**. NAGAR is **in discussion** with the State Directorate of Archaeology and Museums, to undertake rejuvenation work on forts at Worli and Sewri. NAGAR is **currently working on a proposal for the surroundings of Worli and Sewri Fort**.

### **World Heritage Project:**

- On 30th July 2018, the **‘Victorian Gothic and Art Deco Ensembles of Mumbai’, (WHS) consisting of 92 buildings, was inscribed as a UNESCO WHS under the ‘Cultural Site’ category**. The proposal for the **World Heritage inscription was endorsed by the Government of Maharashtra and the Government of**



India and sent to UNESCO as India's nomination for this prestigious international award.

- **NAGAR has supported the next phase of this project** by providing office space for the **conservation architect appointed by the stakeholders**. She will **look into the compliance issues required by UNESCO** and work on the coordination with all Authorities, namely GoM, MCGM, MHCC and the A Ward where the Site is situated.
- In addition the following work is being undertaken:
  - a) Coordinating the **making a short film of the inscribed Site** and the important buildings within it. This film will be shown at all relevant events and seminars and uploaded on appropriate social media sites and television. A well-crafted film will not only benefit the city's heritage tourism but will create worldwide awareness of Mumbai's wonderful architectural history and most importantly, it will help preserve and protect this unique heritage for generations to come.
  - b) A **Draft Signage Plan for the inscribed site** is being designed.

The UNESCO and ICOMOS Evaluation reports have strongly recommended an effective visitor management plan as one of the important prerequisites to upload the heritage tag of the Ensemble. A Signage Plan for the core Ensemble area has been drafted for the same. This plan suggests **suitable locations for different types of signage boards – Information plaques, direction boards, WHS logo and Emblem boards, etc. Signage type, mounting type and the content of each of the boards** has been **designed and illustrated** in the draft plan. These signage types and locations are suggested after conducting site visits and photographic documentation within the Ensemble area. The plan also **recommends additional ideas for an inclusive approach to interpretation through signage boards.**

- i. **A compilation of the individually listed buildings (Grade I, II, IIA, and III) within the Ensembles has been prepared.** Information was sought from Deputy Municipal Architect (DP) and Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee (MHCC), MCGM under RTI to get an update on the final status of this list. In response, it was stated that the heritage list has not been updated for the MCGM

Ward 'A' since 2012 and all buildings listed in this list are deemed to be protected till notified otherwise.

- ii. Information was sought under RTI with regard to the current status of the repair works at the Esplanade Mansion and about approvals and permissions granted by MHCC for renovation work undertaken at Sabalan (Army Restaurant), Esplanade Mansion. In response, the MHCC and MHADA stated that no such approval or permission has been granted. The application was also redirected to PWD by MHADA, who responded saying no such information is available with them. This issue is being followed up with the State Government as Esplanade Mansion has been specifically mentioned by UNESCO in its inscription document.
- iii. **NAGAR has been vigilant about the ongoing restoration process of the Eros Cinema and is pursuing the MHCC to retain its Art Deco features.**

To keep track of the work, **NAGAR sought information under RTI** from the office of the Assistant Municipal Commissioner, A ward for correspondence with owners, tenants / occupants of Eros cinema or any architect with reference to MCGM. In response, **Designated Officer (Building & Factory), A-Ward shared a letter written to Dy. Municipal Architect (Development Plan) Heritage, dated 24.09.2018, which stated that in a site inspection of Eros Cinema conducted on 11.09.2018, no work was found to be in progress and therefore no action was warranted at that stage.** Further, it was suggested that officials from A-Ward and MCGM conduct a joint site visit.

As a response to NAGAR's letter dated 06.06.2018 to the MHCC, expressing concern for the heritage value of Eros Cinema in the light of any potential proposals for its adaptive reuse, **MHCC called NAGAR for a hearing** to be held on October 11, 2018. NAGAR attended the said hearing and presented its views, and also shared a letter further to the previous one, which included the status of Eros Cinema as a part of the UNESCO World Heritage Site and the recommendation given by UNESCO for its revival. **NAGAR insisted that the Art Deco features on the façade as well as the interiors of the cinema be preserved.**

**At the hearing conducted by the MHCC on October 11, 2018, NAGAR was asked to submit any documents indicating which Art Deco elements must be preserved. NAGAR submitted a letter consisting the same dated October 15, 2018, along with enclosed copies of excerpts and photographs from books – ‘Bombay Art Deco Architecture: A Visual Journey (1930-53)’, by Navin Ramani and ‘Bombay Deco’, by Sharada Dwivedi and Rahul Mehrotra. NAGAR also requested to view any proposal received by MHCC for Eros cinema.**

NAGAR received a letter from MHCC, dated 23.10.2018, on October 29, 2018, regarding the acknowledgement of our submitted documents as well as our presence at the hearing. They mentioned that a proposal has been sent to them for their approval as well. NAGAR sent a letter on October 30, 2018, reiterating its request to view this proposal. However, no response to this letter has been given by MHCC till date.

**NAGAR sought information under RTI regarding any proposals for repairs / renovation / restoration of Eros cinema, Cumbatta building. The information, comprising drawings submitted to MHCC as well as a letter stating the approval for the same by MHCC, was collected on 07.03.2019. The proposal involves partial conversion of usage from theatre to retail. While the letter states that the Art Deco features will be preserved during this renovation, the drawings do not indicate the same.**

### **Quality of Air:**

- **CLEAN-Air (CA) was a member of the Bombay High Court appointed V. M. Lal Committee to examine, consider and recommend measures to reduce vehicular pollution in Greater Mumbai.**

As a member of this Co-ordination Committee, CA worked on various issues arising out of the Bombay High Court Order. Like, **the institution of flying squads of RTO and traffic police.** Its suggestions, in keeping with the Court Orders, on matters relating to polluting vehicles, resulted in **complete conversion to clean fuel of the taxi fleet (of 55,000 taxis) and a phase-out of almost 20,000 fifteen-year old un-road-worthy heavy vehicles.**

- CA was part of the **Governance sub-group of Mumbai Transformation Project support unit** which was a **major initiative** to effect a quantum leap forward in the city's development and ability to **handle unforeseen circumstances and disasters as the Mumbai floods**.
- The **Concerned Citizen's Committee (CCC)** was formed by well-respected citizens to **conduct public hearings on the reasons why the deluge of 26.07.05** brought the city to a standstill. **NAGAR was one of the participants** at the planning stage to put together a format for the hearings. It **heard the citizens of Mumbai who were affected and aggrieved by the deluge of 26/7**. The eminent panelists Justice P.B.Sawant, Ms. Teesta Setalvad, Mr. Shyam Chainani, Mr. Sharad Kale, Ms Pushpa Bhave, Mr. Chandra Shekhar Prabhu. Mr. Darryl D'monte and Mr. Dutta Ishwalkar **put together a comprehensive dossier on all facets which lead to the disaster and the corrective measure that should be taken by the authorities and the government agencies**, the report was named **"Mumbai Marooned"**.
- It **attended and participated in the Mill Land hearings** and partnered with other NGOs to try and rationalize the extremely lopsided orders delivered by the Supreme Court on the matter.
- CA drove the **newspaper campaign with Hindustan Times to highlight the issue of air pollution with a series of articles**. This created public awareness and finally response from the authorities.
- **NAGAR is currently pursuing the matter of air pollution specifically with regards to Construction and Demolition Waste. A Focus Group Meeting (FGM) was held at NAGAR office to discuss the issue of air pollution**. It was discussed that the issue of Construction & Demolition waste towards dust mitigation is a great concern especially as DP 2034 envisages a spurt in redevelopment and construction projects. NAGAR approached NEERI to understand its role in abating air pollution and its scope of work. NAGAR has also approached the Maharashtra Pollution Control Board (MPCB) and **sought information under RTI regarding the Greater Mumbai-specific air quality management plan & action plan chalked out by MPCB under the National Clean Air Programme (NCAP) for tackling air pollution in Greater Mumbai**.

NAGAR had also asked for a list of defaulters against whom action has been taken by the MPCB for causing air pollution. **NAGAR received a response from the MPCB stating that the plan is being prepared.** It also received a copy of the order given by the **National Green Tribunal dated 08.10.2018.** The said order states that **“the Chief Secretaries of the State and Administrators / Advisors to Administrators of the Union Territories will be personally accountable for failure to formulate Action Plans, as directed.”** Thus, laying greater emphasis on urgent steps to be taken for abating air pollution.

- **NAGAR has been following the matter vigorously and plans to conduct a roundtable conference of concerned citizens to discuss strategies** to start a dialogue with the authorities for abatement of air pollution and improving the ambient air quality.

### **Slum Rehabilitation on Public Open Spaces:**

- NAGAR filed a **Writ Petition in 2002** urging the Court to address issues regarding legitimising encroachment of reserved public open spaces under the garb of Slum rehabilitation. **NAGAR challenged the process of in-situ free housing for slum dwellers concerning two specific areas – Public Open Spaces and No Development Zones.** Within the ambit of its Writ Petition 1152 of 2002, the layouts are shared with CitiSpace (the Petitioner, NAGAR’s erstwhile constituent) are studied and scrutinized, and meetings are held between the Petitioner, developers and the representatives from the Slum Rehabilitation Authority (SRA) for approval or disapproval of the proposed projects.
- **NAGAR has successfully recorded a digital database of all such cases so as to ascertain the number of reserved public open spaces that have been returned to the city through this exercise.**
- Based on the Bombay High Court Order of 2002, whereby **construction of slum schemes is not allowed on open spaces, such as carriage ways, roads, No Development Zones, etc., SRA Schemes** for two areas **were carefully scrutinized by CitiSpace and constructive inputs** on both these **were made to the Court**, such that Reserved Open Spaces which are in danger from being constructed upon under SRA proposals are protected. The two Schemes

scrutinized were 3 Recreational Grounds (RGs), 3 Playgrounds (PGs) and 2 Gardens (Gs) of Golibar Nagar, Santacruz (W) and RG at Jerbai Wadia Raod, Bhoiwada, Parel. The suggestions given by CitiSpace were:

1. The proposed DP roads that allow road level access to both fragments of the relocated RG are in existence at the time of completion of the SRA Scheme and the handing over of the relocated reserved RG at the new site.
  2. The entire portion of the relocated reserved RG that abuts this proposed DP road is fenced with spatial fencing. E.g. Oval Maidan.
  3. The portion of the fragmented RG that is steeply contoured is made safe by installing high and spatial fencing on these sides.
  4. The inaccessibility of the site from the main, existing road i.e. Jeerbai Wadia Road is compensated by creating accessibility to the site by creating aesthetically appealing and ergonomically sound approaches in the form of steps and ramps, ensuring accessibility to the aged, young, persons with disabilities or on wheelchairs, alike.
- **CitiSpace's inputs** for both plots were accepted by the Court, in addition to the following features, which are to be included / provided for
    - (a) Spatial fencing of the complete playground for e.g. Oval Maidan.
    - (b) Install lockable gates
    - (c) Security round the clock with adequate lighting
    - (d) Mali Chowky 10 x 10ft only
    - (e) Planting of trees and turf
    - (f) Open to sky with permeable ground
    - (g) No construction allowed whatsoever
    - (h) The plots are not, at any time, including after 89m, allowed for any private function, gathering, etc.
  - **In 2003, an attempt by authorities to declare areas in the Aarey Milk Colony (NDZ area) as slums and propose projects for rehabilitation was foiled by CitiSpace (NAGAR). Thus, saving vital green space.** The Aarey Milk Colony, a No Development Zone (NDZ), was proposed for slum rehabilitation. Their thrust was that the span area of the NDZ is 400 acres out of which 120 acres is encroached upon. SRA suggested that it would take ONLY 50 acres (Two and a

half times the size of OVAL MAIDAN) of the NDZ land for accommodating all encroachments and free 70 acres, to give back to the city! Upon inspection of documents and investigating the extent of encroachments with assistance from an urban planner, CitiSpace (NAGAR) discovered that barracks built for Aarey staff were declared as slums! The large proportions of green areas were not encroached upon as shown in the documents and some areas declared as slums were smaller in sizes than declared. Photographs were taken, maps marked and affidavits drafted – all of which stood firm in the eyes of the judiciary and the proposal was dismissed.

- **The SRA case, filed in 2002, came up for final hearing on 29-8-2013 after twelve years.** It was decided by the Justices that under the aegis of the Advocate General the Parties in the matter should sit together and find a solution to the issue of working out alternative rehabilitation schemes for slum dwellers currently encroaching on Reserved Public Open Spaces. Several meetings have been held and the process is continuing.

### **Road Space Management:**

#### **The Churchgate Revival Project:**

- This project was overseen by four of NAGAR's trustees who were co-ordinating the exercise in affiliation with resident associations of the project area. **The implementation of the project involved interventions such as road dividers, pedestrian crossings, subways, one -way route etc.** Designs based on the BMC's street furniture catalogue were put together by the UDRI architects to be used by the CHURCHGATE REVIVAL area as guidelines for those wishing to adopt their pavements. They were also given the Traffic Police details of the new signages required for re-routing traffic for the one-way plan. **The Churchgate Revival team organised meetings with its participative groups such as the Marine Drive Citizens' Association for sorting out the traffic chaos on A, B, C, and D Roads, Churchgate, as well as that on IMC Marg.**

#### **Network for Transportation Alternatives (NeTrA):**

- NeTrA was a network of organizations, associations and citizens that was **formed in response to the growing traffic and its affiliated problems faced by Mumbai**

Page 23 of 25

**City.** It was an instrument for coordination. Some of the constituent members of NeTrA were: BEAG (Bombay Environmental Action Group), CLEAN-Air, NAGAR, Critical Mass, CitiSpace and Parisar Vikas. NAGAR and its constituents, CLEAN-Air and CitiSpace, played a major role in getting this networking body together. **The group's mission was to network and campaign for the formulation and implementation of an Integrated Transport Policy, and the setting up of a Unified Transport Authority for the Mumbai Metropolitan Region (MMR), particularly focusing on the need to upgrade and prioritise sustainable transport and mass transport systems.** On January 4, 2002, NeTrA met with the then Chief Secretary Mr. Ranganathan and representatives of MMRDA, BEST, BMC, Railways, and Traffic Police and **presented a detailed paper.** NeTrA was invited by the MMDRA to attend several meetings with the World Bank MUTP Assessment team that was putting together the final touches on the MUTP document.

### **Better Policing:**

- **In 2014, NAGAR added a program on Better Policing.** This program was **funded by Friedrich Neumann Foundation (FNF)** under FCRA and the MoU was signed between NAGAR & FNF in January 2015. This program includes:
  - **Advocating for:**
    - Public demand for Better Policing & Police Reforms
    - Safe, secure and crime-free environment in Greater Mumbai
    - Amicable partnership & interaction between the Citizens & the Police
    - Issues of public concern with reference to policing
- NAGAR conducted **several orientation sessions on Better Policing in schools and colleges.** NAGAR realised that the existing modes of approach to and interaction with the Police were daunting to the ordinary citizen, thus preventing an **amicable relationship between the Police and the Public.** In an effort to rectify this position, NAGAR conducted public meetings in various fora and attempted to address the concerns and doubts of the citizens. NAGAR also **published a pocket size “Mumbai Police Helpline Directory”** and **demonstrated the functioning of the Virtual police station,** a programme for public information (prepared by



CHRI), at a Press Conference. NAGAR initiated **several meetings with police officials of different ranks and garnered inputs from retired officials**, to better understand issues that concern the public vis-à-vis policing.

- NAGAR conducted an **awareness campaign on traffic rules through its social media platform** like Facebook and twitter. For instance, issues like parking and right of way to pedestrians.

### **Preservation of Water Bodies & Water Conservation:**

- **Students of the College of Social Work, Nirmala Niketan were placed with NAGAR for their internship.** Working in teams of two, they **covered two programs – 1. Preservation & Restoration of Water Bodies and Beaches; 2. Water Conservation.**
- The team working on ‘Preservation & Restoration of Water Bodies and Beaches’ **prepared a case study on the status on water bodies in P-North Ward**, MCGM’s largest ward (area-wise). They also prepared a booklet to guide citizens on what they can do to save, protect & conserve water bodies.
- The **team working on ‘Water Conservation’ made 2 site visits:** 1. The Central Railways – Lokmanya Tilak Terminus – where Rainwater Harvesting though initiated, was being done haphazardly; 2. K. J. Somaiya College – who have started a successful Rainwater Harvesting project, maintained by the college. The team also prepared slogans and graphics to spread awareness of water conservation and the importance of using this scarce commodity judiciously. With support from sponsors, NAGAR hopes to print these as stickers to convey the message and distribute them at appropriate places such as educational Institutions and restaurants across Mumbai.